

Republic of the Philippines Supreme Court Manila

EN BANC

OFFICE OF THE COURT ADMINISTRATOR,

- versus -

Complainant,

A.M. No. P-69-2547

Present:

CARPIO, VELASCO, JR., LEONARDO-DE CASTRO, BRION, PERALTA, BERSAMIN, DEL CASTILLO, ABAD, VILLARAMA, JR., PEREZ, MENDOZA, SERENO, REYES, and PERLAS-BERNABE, JJ.

LUNALINDA M. PERADILLA, Clerk of Court II, Municipal Circuit Trial Court, El Nido-Linapacan, Palawan, Respondent.

Promulgated:

JULY 17, 2012 Aprilat _____.

DECISION

PER CURIAM:

This administrative case arose from the financial audit conducted by an audit team of the Office of the Court Administrator (OCA) in the Municipal Circuit Trial Court (MCTC) of El Nido-Linapacan, Palawan. In a letter dated 3 December 2008,¹ Presiding Judge Ma. Theresa P. Mangcucang-Navarro of the MCTC of El Nido-Linapacan, Palawan, requested then Court Administrator Jose P. Perez (now Supreme Court Justice) that a financial audit be conducted on the books of account of the said court. The request was made after Judge Mangcucang-Navarro discovered that Clerk of Court Lunalinda M. Peradilla (Peradilla) had been remiss in remitting the Judiciary Development Funds and the Fiduciary Funds.

On 16 to 22 April 2009, the audit team of OCA (Financial Audit Team) conducted a financial audit of the books of accounts of the MCTC of El Nido-Linapacan, Palawan, covering the accountabilities of the following accountable officers with the corresponding accountability period:

- 1. Ms. Nora G. Daquer 1 January 2000 to 31 March 2001
- 2. Mr. Reynaldo N. Valenzuela 1 April 2001 to 6 February 2003
- 3. Ms. Lunalinda M. Peradilla 7 February 2003 to 16 December 2008
- 4. Ms. Gracilia D. Abes 17 December 2008 to 31 March 2009

The Financial Audit Team submitted the following findings:²

Examination of the documents presented disclosed the following accountabilities for the different judiciary funds of the accountable officers, to wit:

For the Judiciary Development Fund							
Accountable OfficerAccountability PeriodTotal CollectionsTotal RemittancesBalance of Accountability							
Ms. Daquer	1/1/00-3/31/01	₽ 27,820.10	₽ 27,770.10	₽ 50.00*			
Mr. Valenzuela	4/1/01-2/6/03	23,834.90	23,831.50	3.40*			
Ms. Peradilla	2/7/03-12/16/08	115,050.75	52,203.20	62,847.55			

Rollo, p. 10.

Memorandum for Court Administrator Jose P. Perez dated 14 May 2009; id. at 3-9.

Ms. Abes	12/17/08-3/31/09	7,395.33	7,395.33		0.00		
TOTAL		₽174,101.08	₽111,200.13	₽	62,900.95		
*Both restituted per deposit slip dated April 28, 2009 (Annex "6")							

For the Special Allowance for the Judiciary Fund							
AccountableAccountabilityOfficerPeriod		Total Collections	Total Remittances	Balance of Accountability			
Ms. Peradilla	11/11/03-12/16/08	₽302,046.30	₽ 88,778.20	₽ 213,268.10			
Ms. Abes	12/17/08-3/31/09	26,618.00	26,618.00	0.00			
TOTAL		₽328,664.30	₽ 115,396.20	₽ 213,268.10			

For the General Fund						
Accountable Officer	Accountability Period	Total Collections	Total Remittances	Balance of Accountability		
Ms. Daquer	1/1/00-3/31/01	₽ 1,555.90	₽ 1,555.90	P 0.00		
Mr. Valenzuela	4/1/01-2/6/03	1,569.10	1,569.10	0.00		
Ms. Peradilla	2/7/03-11/10/03	716.80	703.60	13.20		
TOTAL		₽ 3,841.80	₽ 3,828.60	₽ 13.20		

	For the Mediation Fund						
Accountable Officer	Accountability Period	Total Collections	Total Remittances	Balance of Accountability			
Ms. Peradilla	11/1/04-12/16/08	₽ 18,500.00	₽ 0.00	₽ 18,500.00			
Ms. Abes	12/17/08-3/31/09	₽ 3,000.00	3,000.00	0.00			
TOTAL	·	₽ 21,500.10	₽ 3,000.00	₽ 18,500.00			

D	22 000 00
¥	33,000.00
	1,047,000.00
P	1,080,000.00
_	481,500.00
₽	598,500.00
	289,500.00
P	309,000.00*

*It will increase by $\cancel{P46,000.00}$ if Ms. Peradilla fails to submit the court order of withdrawal and the liquidation report of the $\cancel{P22,000.00}$ which she withdrew in Election Protest No. 2007-01; and confirmation from Mr. Dieter Vogt, accused

in Crim Case Nos. 933 and 810, that he actually received from Ms. Peradilla the bonds he posted in the aforesaid cases totaling P24,000.00 (P12,000.00 each per OR Nos. 15847241 and 15847242)

In summary, Clerk of Court Lunalinda M. Peradilla incurred a *total accountability of P603,628.85* for the different judiciary funds as represented hereunder:

Judiciary Development Fund	₽ 62,847.55
Special Allowance for the Judiciary Fund	213,268.10
General Fund	13.20
Mediation Fund	18,500.00
Fiduciary Fund	309,000.00
TOTAL	<u>₽ 603,628.85</u>

 $\mathbf{X} \mathbf{X} \mathbf{X} \mathbf{X}$

The Financial Audit Team found that the bulk of Peradilla's accountability was due to her non-remittance of the judiciary funds, especially the collections for Fiduciary Fund. The Financial Audit Team also uncovered a total of P235,000 representing unreceipted and unreported collections. It was also found that Peradilla intentionally made erroneous reports regarding some of the collections, thus:

Further, the team uncovered her [Peradilla] practice of erroneously reporting her collections. This practice enriched her in the amount [of] P20,187.50, as presented in the immediately following table:

Date of Collection	OR No.	Amount per OR	Amount Reported	Difference
11/13/06	3610603	₽ 12,625.00	₽ 1,262.50	₽ 11,362.50
11/13/06	3610577	9,250.00	925.00	8,325.00
12/11/06	3610634	600.00	100.00	500
Total		₽ 22,475.00	₽ 2,287.50	₽ 20,187.50

The Court Administrator adopted the findings of the Financial Audit Team in its Memorandum dated 14 May 2009.³ In a Resolution dated 1 July 2009, the Court docketed the report by the Financial Audit Team as an

4

³ Id. at 1-2.

administrative complaint against Peradilla. The Court resolved:

(1) To *NOTE* the aforesaid report by the Financial Audit Team;

(2) To *DOCKET* the report as an administrative complaint against Clerk of Court Lunalinda M. Peradilla.

(3) To *DIRECT* the Clerk of Court Lunalinda M. Peradilla to:

(3.1) EXPLAIN in writing within ten (10) days from notice:

(3.1.1) her non-remittance of collections for the different judiciary funds;

(3.1.2) her non-issuance of official receipts and nonreporting in the Monthly Reports of Collections and Deposits of the following collections:

Date of Collections	Case No.	Payor	A	Amount
12/22/05	971	Juanito Nunez	Php	15,000.00
02/01/06	943	Edgar Factor		5,000.00
02/01/06	944	Edgar Factor		5,000.00
02/01/06	947	Cerelino Factor		5,000.00
02/01/06	948	Cerelino Factor		5,000.00
05/06/05	901	Rodrigo S. Bautista	Php	200,000.00
TOTAL			Php	235,000.00

(3.1.3) for refunding only Thirty Thousand ($\textcircledarrow 30,000.00$) Pesos, instead of the whole amount of Two Hundred Thousand ($\textcircledarrow 200,000.00$) Pesos to Mr. Rodrigo S. Bautista, payor/claimant in Crim. Case No. 901, despite the issuance of Court Order dated 08 May 2007 authorizing the release of the whole amount to the payor/claimant; and

(3.1.4) for erroneous reporting in the Monthly Reports of Collections and Deposits [of] the following collections:

Date of Collection	OR No.	Amount per OR	Amount Reported	Difference
11/13/06	3610603	Php 12,625.00	Php 1,262.50	Php 11,362.50
11/13/06	3610577	9,250.00	925.00	8,325.00
12/11/06	3610634	600.00	100.00	500.00

Total	Php	22,475.00	Php 2,287.50	Php 20,187.50

(3.2) to *SUBMIT* to the Fiscal Monitoring Division, Court Management Office, the Office of the Court Administrator, within thirty (30) days from notice: (1) the court order of withdrawal and the liquidation report of the Twenty Two Thousand (P22,000.00) Pesos which she withdrew in Election Protest No. 2007-01; and (2) confirmation from Mr. Dieter Vogt, accused in Criminal Case Nos. 933 and 810, that he actually received the bonds he posted in the aforesaid cases totaling to Twenty Four Thousand (P24,000.00) Pesos [P12,000.00 each per OR Nos. 15847241 and 15847242); otherwise, *PAY* the same; and

(3.3) to *RESTITUTE* the amounts of Sixty Two Thousand Eight Hundred Forty Seven (P62,847.55) Pesos and 55/100, Two Hundred Thirteen Thousand Two Hundred Sixty Eight (P213,268.10) Pesos and 10/100, Thirteen (P13.20) Pesos and 20/100, Eighteen Thousand Five Hundred (P18,500.00) Pesos and Three Hundred Nine Thousand (P309,000.00) Pesos, representing her shortages for Judiciary Development Fund, Special Allowance for the Judiciary Fund, General Fund, Mediation Fund, and Fiduciary Fund, respectively, and FURNISH the Fiscal Monitoring Division, Court Management Office, the Office of the Court Administrator, copies of machine validated deposit slips as proof of compliance;

4. to *DIRECT* Officer-in-Charge Gracilia D. Abes to *STRICTLY ENFORCE* the compliance with the circulars and issuances of the Court particularly in the handling of Judiciary Funds.⁴

In her one-page letter dated 19 April 2010,⁵ Peradilla did not refute the findings of the Financial Audit Team. In fact, Peradilla requested that the monetary equivalent of her earned vacation and sick leave for her 16 years of service in the Judiciary be used to restitute the shortages she incurred. Peradilla stated in her letter:

This has reference to A.M. No. 09-5-90-MCTC (A.M. No. P-09-2647, Re: Report on the Financial Audit conducted in the MCTC of El Nido-Linapacan)

The financial audit conducted last April 2009 on my collection discloses that I have a shortage of Php 62,847.55 for Judiciary Fund;

⁴ Id. at 19-21.

⁵ Id. at 48.

Php 213,263.00 for Special Allowance for Judiciary; Php 13.20 for General Fund; and Php 18,500.00 for Mediation Fund. For these, and with all humility, I am respectfully requesting your good Office that my earned leaves for my 16 years in the Judiciary be computed and be credited to restitute the above-mentioned amounts. My records from the Leave Division show that I have earned 46 vacation leave and 162 sick leave as of May 31, 2009.

Likewise, I humbly pray that if the amount equivalent to my earned leave is not sufficient to cover these shortages, may I request that my salaries withheld since March 2008 be released and be credited to said shortages.⁶

In another signed letter dated 8 April 2011,⁷ Peradilla again admitted misappropriating the court funds. Peradilla alleged that she only intended to "borrow" the funds but unfortunately, she failed to replace the "borrowed" funds. Peradilla explained:

Before 2005, the users of the Postal Money Order (PMO) forms are the Court and the Jehova's witnesses only. When the Philippine Ports Authority started its operation in El Nido, it also purchases PMO to facilitate its remittances. Hence, many times, there was non-availability of PMO forms to facilitate my remittances to the Supreme Court. At that time, I have three children studying in college. The school fees and the students' allowances increased, more projects and contributions were needed, and the costly educational tours became part of college life. Besides, there were electric bills, loans to be paid, budget for food, clothing and other expenses. My salary can no longer meet these needs. My husband works as a butcher only in the nearby slaughterhouse, and there were many competitors. There were younger, faster, and stronger butchers than him. Since I kept the court's funds, and since there was no available PMO yet, and instead of borrowing money from loan sharks, I started granting loan to myself with a promise in mind that I will replace the same whenever my salary comes [sic].

Our very limited income, the non-availability of PMO forms, aggravated by my children's financial needs for their schooling resulted to my JDF accountabilities of Php 62,847.55; from SAJ, my accountabilities reached Php 213,268.10; my Mediation amounts to Php 18,500.00; and my Fiduciary amounts to Php 163,000.00. My total accountabilities amounted to Php 457,615.65. Likewise, I have an unliquidated amount of Php 22,000 in Election Protest No. 2007-01.⁸

⁶ Although Peradilla inadvertently omitted the shortage of ₽309,000.00 for Fiduciary Fund, she never denied or refuted such finding by the Financial Audit Team.

⁷ *Rollo*, pp. 54-57.

⁸ Id. at 54-55.

In its Memorandum dated 13 October 2011,⁹ the OCA recommended that:

1) The Fiscal Management Office, OCA be DIRECTED to PROCESS the money value of the terminal leave pay of Ms. Peradilla and DEDUCT therefrom the total shortages of P603,628.85:

Judiciary Development Fund (JDF)	₽	62,847.55
Special Allowance for the Judiciary Fund (SAJF)		213,268.10
General Fund (GF)		13.20
Mediation Fund (MF)		18,500.00
Fiduciary Fund (FF)		309,000.00
Total	₽	<u>603,628.85</u>

2) The Cash Division, FMO, OCA be DIRECTED to:

a. DEPOSIT the amount of P62,847.55, P213,268.10, P13.20 and P18,500.00 to the Judiciary Development Fund, Special Allowance for the Judiciary Fund, General Fund and Mediation Fund accounts, respectively, within two (2) days from receipt of the checks from the Checks Disbursement Division, FMO, OCA; and

b. FURNISH immediately the Fiscal Monitoring Division, Court Management Office, OCA and Ms. Gracilia D. Abes, Officer-in-Charge, MCTC, El Nido-Linapacan, Palawan, with copies of machine validated deposit slips as proof that the amount deducted from the money value of the earned leave credits of Ms. Peradilla was deposited to the respective accounts, as payment of the shortages in said account;

3) Ms. Gracilia D. Abes, Officer-in-Charge, MCTC, El Nido-Linapacan, Palawan be DIRECTED to DEPOSIT the amount of P309,000.00 to the Municipal Treasurer's Office (MTO) of El Nido, Palawan, within five (5) days from receipt of the check from the Checks Disbursement Division, FMO, OCA and FURNISH immediately the FMD, CMO, OCA with [a] certified true copy of the Original Receipt, as proof that the amount of P309,000.00 was deposited to MTO;

4) The Office of Administrative Services, OCA be DIRECTED to furnish the Fiscal Management Office, OCA with the Official Service Record, Certification of Leave Credits and Notice of Salary Adjustments (NOSA) of Clerk of Court Peradilla so that the latter Office can process/comply with the directives in item #1 above;

Id. at 69-72.

5) Ms. Lunalinda M. Peradilla, Clerk of Court, MCTC, El Nido, Palawan be DISMISSED from the service for gross dishonesty resulting to malversation of public funds, with forfeiture of all retirement benefits excluding accrued leave credits, with prejudice to re-employment in any government office, including government-owned and controlled corporations; and

6) Hon. Judge Ma. Theresa P. Mangcucang-Navarro, MCTC, El Nido, Palawan, be DIRECTED to STRICTLY MONITOR Ms. Gracilia D. Abes, Officer-in-Charge, MCTC, El Nido-Linapacan, Palawan, to ensure strict compliance with the circulars and issuance of the Court, particularly in the handling of judiciary funds, otherwise, she shall be held equally liable for the infractions committed by the employee/s under her command/supervision.

We agree with the findings and recommendations of the Court Administrator. However, Peradilla's accountability for the Fiduciary Fund shortage should be increased by P46,000.00.

Section 1, Article XI of the Constitution declares that a public office is a public trust, and all public officers and employees must at all times be accountable to the people, serve them with utmost responsibility, integrity, loyalty, and efficiency, act with patriotism and justice, and lead modest lives. The demand for moral uprightness is more pronounced for the members and personnel of the judiciary who are involved in the dispensation of justice. The conduct of court members and personnel must not only be characterized with propriety and decorum but must also be above suspicion,¹⁰ for any act of impropriety can seriously erode or diminish the people's confidence in the judiciary.¹¹ As frontliners in the administration of justice, they should live up to the strictest standards of honesty and integrity in the public service.¹²

¹⁰ Office of the Court Administrator v. Besa, 437 Phil. 372 (2002).

Office of the Court Administrator v. Lometillo, A.M. No. P-09-2637, 29 March 2011, 646 SCRA 542.
Payment on the Eingneigl Audit in the MTC. Sta. Cruz. Dayse del Sur 508 Phil 142 (2005).

Re: Report on the Financial Audit in the MTC, Sta. Cruz, Davao del Sur, 508 Phil. 143 (2005).

13

Clerks of Court act as custodians of the court's funds, revenues, records, property and premises and are thus, liable for any loss, shortage, destruction or impairment of such funds and property.¹³

Supreme Court Circular No. 50-95 directs that "all collections from bailbonds, rental deposits, and other fiduciary collections shall be deposited within twenty four (24) hours by the Clerk of Court concerned, upon receipt thereof, with the Land Bank of the Philippines." In cases where there are no branches of the Land Bank of the Philippines in the locality concerned, the Circular states that the fiduciary collections should be deposited by the Clerk of Court with the Provincial, City or Municipal Treasurer.

As regards Judiciary Development Fund, Administrative Circular No. 5-93 provides that:

3. Duty of the Clerks of Court, Officers-in-Charge or accountable officers. – The Clerks of Court, Officers-in-Charge of the Office of the Clerk of Court, or their accountable duly authorized representative designated by them in writing, who must be accountable officers, shall receive the Judiciary Development Fund collections, issue the proper receipt therefor, maintain a separate cash book properly marked CASH BOOK FOR JUDICIARY DEVELOPMENT FUND, deposit such collections in the manner herein prescribed, and render the proper Monthly Report of Collections for said Fund.

4. Depository bank for the Fund. – The amounts accruing to the Fund shall be deposited for the account of the Judiciary Development Fund, Supreme Court, Manila by the Clerks of Court, Officers-in-Charge of the Office of the Clerk of Court in authorized government depository bank or private bank owned or controlled by the Government to be specified by the Chief Justice. The income or interest earned shall likewise form part of the Fund. For this purpose, the depository bank for the Fund shall be the Land Bank of the Philippines (LBP).

Report on the Financial Audit Conducted on the Books of Account of Sonia L. Dy and Atty. Graciano D. Cuanico, Jr., RTC, Catarman, Northern Samar, A.M. No. P-07-2364 and A.M. No. P-11-2902, 25 January 2011, 640 SCRA 376.

As custodian of court funds and revenues, Peradilla is mandated to immediately deposit the court funds or collections in the Land Bank of the Philippines; she is not supposed to keep the funds in her custody.¹⁴ Peradilla admitted that she failed to remit court funds which she used for her family's expenses. In her letter dated 19 April 2010, Peradilla requested that the monetary value of her earned leave credits be used to restitute the shortage of P62,847.55 for Judiciary Fund; P213,263.00 for Special Allowance for Judiciary; P13.20 for General Fund; and P18,500.00 for Mediation Fund.

Although Peradilla inadvertently omitted the shortage of P309,000.00for Fiduciary Fund, she never denied or refuted such finding by the Financial Audit Team. It should be noted that in the Memorandum dated 14 May 2009, the Financial Audit Team reported that Peradilla's accountability for Fiduciary Fund in the amount of ₽309,000.00 "will increase by ₽46,000.00 if Ms. Peradilla fails to submit the court order of withdrawal and the liquidation report of the P22,000.00 which she withdrew in Election Protest No. 2007-01; and the confirmation from Mr. Dieter Vogt, accused in Crim Case Nos. 933 and 810, that he actually received from Ms. Peradilla the bonds he posted in the aforesaid cases totaling P24,000.00 (P12,000.00 each per OR Nos. 15847241 and 15847242)."¹⁵ In her letter dated 8 April 2011, Peradilla admitted that she has an unliquidated amount of P22,000.00 in Election Protest No. 2007-01. Peradilla also failed to secure confirmation from Mr. Vogt that he actually received the P24,000.00 representing the bonds which he posted in Criminal Case Nos. 933 and 810. Thus, with the additional shortage of P46,000.00, the P309,000.00 Fiduciary Fund accountability of Peradilla is increased to P355,000.00.

¹⁵ *Rollo*, p. 5.

¹⁴ *Rebong v. Tengco*, A.M. No. P-07-2338, 7 April 2010, 617 SCRA 460.

Peradilla also failed to issue official receipts and did not report some of the collections in the Monthly Reports of Collections and Deposits. Furthermore, the Financial Audit Team found that Peradilla made erroneous entries in her collections by reporting lesser amounts than the actual amounts collected as indicated in the official receipts.

In *Re: Report on the Judicial and Financial Audit of RTC-Br. 4, Panabo, Davao Del Norte*,¹⁶ the Court held that the failure of the Clerk of Court to remit the court funds constitutes gross neglect of duty, dishonesty, and grave misconduct prejudicial to the best interest of the service. Under Section 52, Rule IV of the Uniform Rules on Administrative Cases in the Civil Service,¹⁷ dishonesty, gross neglect of duty, and grave misconduct are classified as grave offenses with the corresponding penalty of dismissal for the first offense.¹⁸

In this case, Peradilla is guilty of dishonesty, gross neglect of duty, and grave misconduct for her: (1) non-remittance of collections of judiciary funds; (2) non-issuance of official receipts and non-reporting in the Monthly Reports and Collections and Deposits of some of the collections; and (3) erroneous reporting in the Monthly Reports and Collections and Deposits of some of the collections.

18

 ¹⁶ 351 Phil. 1 (1998).
¹⁷ Civil Service Com

Civil Service Commission Resolution No. 99-1936, dated 31 August 1999, otherwise known as the Uniform Rules on Administrative Cases in the Civil Service.

Section 52, Rule IV of the Uniform Rules on Administrative Cases in the Civil Service reads:

Section 52. *Classification of Offenses.* – Administrative offenses with corresponding penalties are classified into grave, less grave or light, depending on their gravity or depravity and effects on the government service.

A. The following are grave offenses with their corresponding penalties:

^{1.} Dishonesty - 1st Offense - Dismissal

^{2.} Gross Neglect of Duty – 1st Offense - Dismissal

^{3.} Grave Misconduct – 1st Offense - Dismissal

WHEREFORE, the Court finds respondent Lunalinda M. Peradilla, Clerk of Court II, Municipal Circuit Trial Court, El Nido-Linapacan, Palawan, **GUILTY** of **DISHONESTY**, **GROSS NEGLECT OF DUTY**, **and GRAVE MISCONDUCT**, and imposes upon her the penalty of **DISMISSAL** from the service. All her retirement benefits, except accrued leave credits, are forfeited and she is barred from re-employment in any branch or instrumentality of the government, including government-owned or controlled corporations.

The Financial Management Office, Office of the Court Administrator, is directed to process the monetary value of the terminal leave pay of Lunalinda M. Peradilla, as well as other benefits or withheld salary she may be entitled to, and deduct the total shortage of P649,628.85.

The Cash Division, Financial Management Office, Office of the Court Administrator is directed to deposit the amount of P62,847.55, P213,268.10, P13.20 and P18,500 to the Judiciary Development Fund, Special Allowance for the Judiciary Fund, General Fund and Mediation Fund accounts, respectively, within two (2) days from receipt of the checks from the Checks Disbursement Division, Financial Management Office, Office of the Court Administrator. The Cash Division, Financial Management Office, Office, Office of the Court Administrator is further directed to furnish immediately the Fiscal Monitoring Division, Court Management Office, Office of the Court Administrator, and Ms. Gracilia D. Abes, Officer-in-Charge, MCTC, El Nido-Linapacan, Palawan, with copies of machine validated deposit slips as proof that the amount deducted from the monetary value of the earned leave credits of Ms. Peradilla was deposited to the respective accounts, as payment of the shortages in said accounts.

Ms. Gracilia D. Abes, Officer-in-Charge, MCTC, El Nido-Linapacan, Palawan, is directed to deposit the amount of P355,000.00 to the Municipal Treasurer's Office of El Nido, Palawan, within five (5) days from receipt of the check from the Checks Disbursement Division, Financial Management Office, Office of the Court Administrator and furnish immediately the Fiscal Monitoring Division, Court Management Office, Office of the Court Administrator with a certified true copy of the Original Receipt, as proof that the amount of P355,000.00 was deposited to the Municipal Treasurer's Office.

The Office of the Court Administrator is ordered to take appropriate steps to file criminal charges against Lunalinda M. Peradilla for malversation of public funds as may be warranted from the facts.

SO ORDERED.

ANTONIO T. CARPIO Senior Associate Justice

PRESBITERÓ J. VELASCO, JR. Associate Justice

ESITA J. LEONARD

DE CASTRO Associate Justice

Decision

A.M. No. P-09-2647

(On leave) ARTURO D. BRICN Associate Justice

DIOSDADOM. PERALTA Associate Justice

MARIANO C. DEL CASTILLO Associate Justice

IMM And ROBERTO Á. ABAD Associate Justice

Acted m 20-Gat. Adm. DRTUGAL BEREZ JOSE P ssociate Justice

MARIA LOURDES P. A. SERENO

Associate Justice

MARTIN S. VILLARAMA, JR. Associate Justice

MENDOZA JOSI ciate Justice Ass

Prof Stance The Car 100 100 100 1000 100 100 100 1000

BIENVENIDO L. REVES Associate Justice

ESTELA M. PERLAS-BERNABE Associate Justice